

The Application of Institutional Excellence Standards in Bethlehem's Private Schools Based on Malcolm Baldrige's Model

Mrs. Shireen Elias Awad¹, Prof. Mahmoud A. Abu Samra^{*2}

¹Bethlehem Education Directorate | Ministry of Education | Palestine

²College of Educational Sciences | Al-Quds University | Palestine

Received:

27/04/2023

Revised:

09/05/2023

Accepted:

08/06/2023

Published:

30/08/2023

* Corresponding author:

abusamra@staff.alquds.edu

[u](mailto:abusamra@staff.alquds.edu)

Citation: Awad, SH. E., &

Abu Samra, M. A. (2023).

The Application of

Institutional Excellence

Standards in Bethlehem's

Private Schools Based on

Malcolm Baldrige's Model.

Journal of Educational and

Psychological Sciences,

7(31), 120 – 132.

<https://doi.org/10.26389/>

[AJSRP.C270423](https://doi.org/10.26389/AJSRP.C270423)

2023 © AISRP • Arab

Institute of Sciences &

Research Publishing

(AISRP), Palestine, all

rights reserved.

• Open Access



This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY-NC) [license](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/)

Abstract: The need for institutional excellence has grown in recent decades as standards of excellence have become a necessity for administrative development to raise the level of performance. This has encouraged the adoption of excellence models, like Malcolm Baldrige's model of institutional excellence. For this, the current study examined the extent to which institutional excellence standards are applied in Bethlehem's private schools based on Malcolm Baldrige's model. The descriptive analytical approach was used, and the population included all teachers and administrative employees in Bethlehem's private schools for the academic year 2022/2023, there number is (860) members. The sample included (214) teachers and administrative employees who were randomly selected (cluster sample). A 42-item questionnaire was designed to collect data. The most important results revealed that the respondents' estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence were applied according to Malcolm Baldrige's model recorded a high score with an average of (3.9). Thus, the study recommended promoting the implementation of standards of institutional excellence in private schools to maintain these good results and improve them.

Keywords: Institutional excellence, Malcolm Baldrige model, private schools, Bethlehem, Palestine.

مدى تطبيق معايير التميز المؤسسي في المدارس الخاصة في محافظة بيت لحم (2022/2023) في ضوء نموذج مالكولم بالدريج (Malcolm Baldrige)

أ. شيرين الياس عواد¹، أ.د./ محمود أحمد أبو سمرة^{*2}

¹ مديرة تربية بيت لحم | وزارة التربية والتعليم | فلسطين

² كلية العلوم التربوية | جامعة القدس | فلسطين

المستخلص: هدفت هذه الدراسة للتعرف على مدى تطبيق معايير التميز المؤسسي في المدارس الخاصة في محافظة بيت لحم في ضوء نموذج مالكولم بالدريج (Malcolm Baldrige) ولتحقيق أهداف الدراسة اعتمدت الباحثة المنهج الوصفي التحليلي. وقد تكون مجتمع الدراسة من جميع المعلمين في المدارس الخاصة في بيت لحم وعددهم (752) معلماً ومعلمة، وجميع الموظفين الإداريين والبالغ عددهم (108) موظفاً وموظفة، للعام الدراسي 2022/2023، في حين ضمت عينة الدراسة (214) معلماً وموظفاً إدارياً تم اختيارهم بطريقة عشوائية طبقية. أما أداة الدراسة فهي الاستبانة، والمكونة من (42) فقرة موزعة على سبعة مجالات تمثل معايير مالكولم بالدريج السبعة وهي: القيادة، التخطيط الاستراتيجي، إدارة الموارد البشرية، القياس والتحليل وإدارة المعرفة، إدارة العمليات، التركيز على الطلبة، ونتائج أداء المدرسة)، وقد تحققت الباحثة من صدقها وثباتها بالطرق التربوية والإحصائية المناسبة، وقد أظهرت نتائج الدراسة أن تقديرات المبحوثين لدى تطبيق معايير التميز المؤسسي وفق نموذج مالكولم بالدريج قد جاءت بدرجة عالية وبمتوسط حسابي بلغ (3.90)، وجاء مجال "معياري نتائج أداء المدرسة" بالمرتبة الأولى بمتوسط (4.00)، بينما جاء مجال "معياري إدارة الموارد البشرية" في المرتبة الأخيرة وبمتوسط (3.74) وجاءت جميع المجالات بدرجة عالية، كما بينت نتائج الدراسة عدم وجود فروق دالة إحصائية بين متوسطات تقديرات أفراد عينة الدراسة لدى تطبيق معايير التميز المؤسسي في المدارس الخاصة في محافظة بيت لحم في ضوء نموذج مالكولم بالدريج تُعزى لتغيرات (الجنس، المؤهل العلمي، سنوات الخبرة)، بينما توجد فروق تُعزى لتغير المسعى الوظيفي لصالح الموظف الإداري، وفي ضوء النتائج التي خرجت بها الدراسة، أوصت الباحثة بتعزيز الاستمرارية في تطبيق معايير التميز المؤسسي في المدارس الخاصة للحفاظ على هذا المستوى والارتقاء به إلى الأعلى، بالإضافة إلى توفير نظام للحوافز والترقيات ووضوح المعالم ومقر من وزارتي العمل والتربية والتعليم يُطبق في المدارس الخاصة يُعزز التميز المؤسسي فيها. كما وقد أوصت الباحثة بدعم استخدام البحث العلمي بالمدارس الخاصة لتحليل وتشخيص المشكلات المدرسية فيها.

الكلمات المفتاحية: التميز المؤسسي، نموذج مالكولم بالدريج، المدارس الخاصة، محافظة بيت لحم.

1-Introduction.

Institutional excellence and its standards have become a necessity for administrative development to raise the level of performance (Abu Raya, 2014), as countries have been much concerned about developing work in educational institutions and forming clear strategic visions and plans for that (Cosby, (2018). In this respect, the concept of institutional excellence and its standards appeared for the first time in the field of industry and economy (Al-Dajani, 2011). Therefore, interest in quality assurance in educational institutions emerged by looking at education as a commodity like all other commodities (Khudair, 2001).

The modern administrative approaches and techniques view excellence as a system that aims to increase the level of achievements and performance to the highest level so that the organization excels over other organizations (Al-Masry, 2015). Therefore, regional and local organizations started motivating institutions to innovate and pushing them to adopt the approach of excellence management (Al-Sousi, 2015). Accordingly, many international standards and models of institutional excellence and total quality emerged. These models include the American Malcolm Baldrige Excellence Model, the European Excellence Model (EFQM), the Deming Award in Japan, etc. (Jaber, 2015). The Baldrige scale consists of seven main elements, from each of which a number of sub-elements branch out, totaling (32) elements that contribute to determining their level and extent of application of the total quality that leads to excellence.

In view of the importance of institutional excellence in general and the adoption of its standards in the educational institutions in Palestine in particular, this study aims to identify the extent to which institutional excellence standards are applied in Bethlehem's private schools based on Malcolm Baldrige's model

Statement of the problem:

The interest in talent management has almost no or limited existence in many educational institutions. There is no specific expression for talent management in many of their human resources departments, moreover there is no system created to attract, train and support those who are more qualified and deserve the job in the field of education. Talent management strategies are unable to engage, motivate and retain talent and enhance performance in their educational institutions. This resulted in lack of attention toward the workers in private educational institutions that aim primarily at obtaining the highest percentage of profits. So, you can imagine how the case be in government educational institutions.

Therefore, this study came in response to recent trends calling for education reform through optimal utilization of human resources and attention to minds and talents, and investment of talents a priority, as they represent the pillar of innovation, development and excellence for any institution, and give it a competitive advantage that distinguishes it from others. Furthermore, the tendency to manage talents in educational institutions has many justifications that must be considered, as there is many evidences proving that it includes the ability of the institution to deal with the competitive environment, which is characterized by the speed of change, and the provision of teachers who have competence to lead the change and development in the institution and its management.

The researchers have noticed, through their work and experiences in the field of education, that there are no clear standards and concepts about the management of gifted and qualified teachers, and that we need a rational and developed school administration that can plan, implement, evaluate and follow up on school affairs, with the ability to attract and retain talented teachers. Our Palestinian society manages these unique mental talents in the best way and creates the appropriate atmosphere for their emergence, upgrading and refinement. The opportunity for the advancement of the Palestinian people in future generations will be missed. Therefore, this study came to determine the degree of application and practice of talent management in private schools, in order to be the first steps towards a real approach by the educational officials to develop regulations and laws aimed at investing talented teachers in schools.

Previous studies showed that the application of Malcolm Baldrige's model of institutional excellence has a positive impact in raising the level of educational institutions. Therefore, there is a need to conduct studies on the Palestinian educational institution, in order to come up with recommendations and results, based on their application of standards of institutional excellence according to Malcolm Bridge's model.

Therefore, this study is carried out to answer the following:

1. To what extent the institutional excellence standards are applied in Bethlehem's private schools based on Malcolm Baldrige's model?
2. Do the respondents' estimates of the extent the institutional excellence standards are applied in Bethlehem's private schools based on Malcolm Baldrige's model differ in terms of gender, educational qualification, experience, and job title?

Hypotheses:

From second question four null hypotheses were conducted:

Ho1. There are no differences at the significance level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) between the averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent the institutional excellence standards are applied on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the gender.

Ho2. There are no differences at the significance level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) between the averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent the institutional excellence standards are applied on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the educational qualification.

Ho3. There are no differences at the significance level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) between the averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent the institutional excellence are applied on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the years of experience.

Ho4. There are no differences at the significance level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) between the averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent the institutional excellence are applied on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the job title variable.

Research Objectives

1. To know the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model from the sample members' viewpoint.
2. To know if the respondents' estimates of the extent to which institutional excellence standards are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model differ in terms of gender, educational qualification, years of experience, and job title.

Research Significance

- Theoretical significance:

This study's significance stems from the significance of its topic represented in the standards of institutional excellence and its role in achieving distinguished education and improving performance in educational institutions in various fields. This study is also a good reference for other researchers, as it is the first study that investigates the application of Malcolm Baldrige model in Palestine.

- Practical Significance:

The results of this study will ultimately highlight the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied according to the Malcolm Baldrige model in the Palestinian schools. This will provide the educational institutions in Palestine with clear understanding of the standards applied in an excellent way, and indicate the standards that need follow-up and development. The subject of this study is also consistent with modern educational directives that urge educational institutions to excel in their performance and empower their students with all educational, creative, moral and human elements.

2-Literature Review

Theoretical Background:

Excellence denotes the skill in managing an organization to achieve outstanding results by adopting a set of practices (Addallal, 2005, p. 27). It is defined as positive excellence and uniqueness in performance, practices, and services provided (Khoqir, 2017). It is a way of life that can be adopted by a small or large organization, governmental or non-governmental, service or commodity-producing (Ajaif, 2008, p. 227). In this respect, institutional excellence is defined as an advanced stage of work quality and efficient and effective performance which is based on modern management concepts. It also means the organization's endeavor to invest appropriate opportunities to achieve high levels of performance. Standen (2004, p. 6) confirms that institutional excellence means "clear identification of customers, extracting their needs and demands..."

Institutional excellence is branched into leadership excellence, human excellence and service excellence. Leadership excellence is expressed through a wise and insightful vision of what is going on in the work and its follow-up and guidance to remedy gaps and shortcomings, while human excellence is represented in trained and qualified human resources with capabilities and competencies to do what is required and more in a framework of excellence and innovation (Draft, 2009). Moreover, excellence in service provision occurs as a result of great competition between organizations (Al-Nuaimi & Al-Sweis, 2008). Al-Jubouri (2009) believes that the objectives of institutional excellence are to improve institutional performance.

Jadurrah (2013) summarizes the objectives of institutional excellence in achieving quality, efficiency, creativity and speed of response, in addition to achieving balanced returns and benefits. Al-Shamayleh (2004) adds that institutional excellence aims to create a flexible work system that is compatible with the requirements and needs of the market, and to raise the level of employees in all scientific, social and practical aspects.

The researchers state that the main goal of institutional excellence is to raise the efficiency of the institution's performance to the highest possible level, the optimal utilization of material, financial and human resources, and attention to the quality of the educational services provided. Battah (2006) mentioned a set of principles of institutional excellence, which are represented in continuity, inclusiveness, a suitable climate for work, focus on future expectations, availability of elements of excellence, focus on things that achieve leadership and excellence, encouraging innovation and creative thinking, and a constant sense of the need to learn. Grote (2002) believes that the characteristics of institutional excellence are the acceptance of difficult work, the provision of efficient leadership, accuracy, training programs, experiences far from work, and the endurance of difficulties (Grote, 2002, p.194).

The institutional excellence's importance becomes obvious when linking it to the ability of organizations to recruit forces that support excellence and to preserve the place and organizational position of the institution (AbuRaya, 2014). It is also important in diagnosing the strengths of

the organization and improving performance and competitive capabilities (Haniyeh, 2016). Moreover, to achieve school excellence, focus on mission clarity and teamwork should be adopted. Education must be clear and focused, using the best educational resources within the available capabilities, and focusing on education being based on knowledge of concepts and their application to become skills (Kiranmayi et al., 2014). An excellent school is defined as: "a school that demonstrates the ability to identify and solve its own problems" (Diab, 2007: 6). Ghorab and Abu Sultan (2007) see that the distinguished school has several characteristics, the most important of which are planning, organizing, directing, and monitoring.

Kahil (2009) outlined the tasks of the school administration to achieve institutional excellence in harnessing all the school's capabilities and the educational means and technologies available to it to enable the school to fulfill its mission, choosing the most skilled and specialized staff to achieve the school's goals, positive interaction with the environment surrounding the school, preparing and guiding teachers, creating all appropriate conditions which help the teacher to play his leading role.

The researchers believe that the aforementioned cannot be achieved without the presence of a principal who leads the school to achieve the desired excellence. The principal of the school, in his capacity as an educational leader and supervisor of teaching staff and employees, is considered influential in all those around him, urging them to take responsibility in achieving the desired educational goals, and gaining with them the outcomes of excellence and the hoped-for successes to be achieved. The functions of an effective principal also include monitoring student progress. In this respect, principals monitor the students' progress in relation to their goals and outcomes (Barkman, 2015).

School principals clearly understand their priorities and devote their time to focus on them (Barkman, 2015). Communication is also among the tasks of an effective principal (Mendels& Mitgang, 2013). In addition, professionalism is an important characteristic that an effective principal must have, as working in an educational environment with a diversity of people and views requires a professional leader (Whitaker, 2012). Creativity is also a characteristic of an effective manager (Whitaker, 2012). Great principals seek to restructure the school by building relationships with parents and linking the school to its community (Klar& Brewer, 2013). This requires a certain degree of creativity (Lin, 2012).

Al-Salami (2002) mentioned that the most important obstacles to institutional excellence are the adoption of traditional administrative patterns and the building of organizational structures based on distant, unconnected groups. There are other several obstacles facing the application of institutional excellence. They include weak strategic plans for change, weak channels of communication, and lack of sufficient awareness of quality and its importance due to the weak conviction of senior leadership and employees of models of excellence (Al-Muzayen& Al-Ghamdi, 2010).

Saqr (2016) classified the obstacles to achieving institutional excellence into organizational obstacles represented in bureaucratic administrations, human obstacles represented in dictatorial leaders, financial obstacles represented in the lack of budgets and sufficient support for the implementation of excellence programs, and technological obstacles that appear in the absence of management of knowledge systems, and the lack of accurate databases, in addition to the old electronic systems and the failure to keep pace with emerging technologies. The researcher believes that many obstacles can be overcome when there are effective capabilities that believe in the benefit of excellence and quality in institutional performance.

There are several dimensions to the Malcolm Baldrige model, which are leadership (US DoCNBS, 2003; Beer, 2003; Flynn et al., 1994) strategic planning (Cosby, 2018; Saygin, 2019) customer and market focus (Bennett & Kinney, 2018) measurement and analysis of knowledge management (US DoCNBS, 2003) Human Resources Focus (Bolaji, 2019; US DoCNBS, 2003) Operations Management (US DoCNBS, 2003) and Business Results (Chaudhry et al., 2019).

The goals of Malcolm Baldrige model are to focus on results in all areas of performance to ensure that all strategies are balanced, goal flexibility, support for a systemic perspective to maintain the process of goal across the organization, support for Objective-Based Diagnostics, delivering Ever-Improving Value to Customers (Setiawan& Purba, 2021), improving the effectiveness of the public organization and raising its capabilities (Heryenzus& Suali, 2018) and providing organizational and personalized learning (Setiawan& Purba, 2021).

Using Baldrige's evaluation criteria improves employee relations, increases productivity, improves customer satisfaction, increases market share, and increases profits (Anastasiadou& Taraza, 2019). Standards also provide organizations with an opportunity to incorporate different management strategies into their strategic policy (such as ISO, Lean, Six Sigma, BSC, etc.) (Aydin& Kahraman, 2019; Rahayu et al., 2019; Hertz 1999, p. 35).

Previous Studies:

Hassan (2021) carried out a research that attempted to know the level of applying the Malcolm Baldrige model criteria for total quality in Baniyas Refinery Company. The descriptive analytical method was used. Moreover, the study population included (1500) workers in Baniyas Refinery Company in Syria. Its sample included 240 workers. It concluded with the result that Malcolm Baldrige standards for total quality combined are adopted in Baniyas Refinery Company.

Alam et al. (2019) did a study to highlight the leadership role of principals and their performance in educational institutions, compared with the leadership qualities of the Baldrige Model. The study population included (100) teachers who were randomly selected from the schools and colleges in Karachi, Pakistan. The study is descriptive in nature, and its tools were a qualitative interview and a questionnaire. The results showed that the leadership role of the heads of the academies and principals enhances the institutions' performance.

In a similar context, Menezes et al. (2018) did a study that attempted to analyze the effectiveness of higher education administration in seven units of a higher education institution located in the Brazilian capital of Belo Horizonte according to the Baldrige Excellence Model. Moreover, a questionnaire was developed to examine the standards of Malcolm Baldrige's model of institutional excellence. The results reflected a positive correlation between all components of the Baldrige Excellence Model with the management effectiveness of the higher education institution.

Apart from this, Akbarnezhad & Dayyani (2018) aimed to evaluate the outstanding performance of Iranian public libraries using the Malcolm Baldrige model. It is descriptive in nature. Moreover, its population consisted of staff librarians and authorities in major Iranian public libraries. Its sample included 210 individuals who were randomly selected. To assess outstanding performance, the Baldrige Excellence Patterns Questionnaire for employees and managers was used (National Institute of Standards and Technology, 2015). The main results reflected that, from the point of view of workers in major public libraries in the country, the outstanding performance in these libraries is in a relatively favorable position.

This study is distinguished from previous studies regarding its population. That is, the populations of the previous studies consisted of workers in companies, hospitals, administrative employees, holders of administrative positions in the Ministry of Education, faculty members in higher education institutions, and teachers of public schools. Contrastingly, this study's population consisted of teachers and administrative staff in private schools only.

3-Research Methodology.

The researchers used the descriptive analytical approach, which is a method of scientific research that is concerned with studying common practices, beliefs, viewpoints and attitudes of people in a particular phenomenon, event or topic, and depends on studying reality as it is and describing it accurately qualitatively or quantitatively using appropriate tools. It includes collecting, tabulating and interpreting information, then writing recommendations to address reality in the event of a specific problem.

Population of the study consisted of (860) teachers and administrative employees (principal, deputy principal, and secretary) from private schools in Bethlehem Governorate, while the study sample included (214) members. The sample constituted (24.8%) of the whole population, and they were chosen randomly (cluster sample). Furthermore, the number of questionnaires retrieved was (214), and all copies were valid for statistical analysis. Table (1) below describes the sample according to its independent variables.

Table (1): Sample distribution according to the study variables

Variables	Level	No.	Percentage
Gender	Male	34	15.9
	Female	180	84.1
Qualification	BA	119	55.6
	BA and Diploma	35	16.4
	Master Degree or higher	60	28.0
Years of experience	5 years or less	48	22.4
	6 – 10 years	47	22.0
	More than 10 years	119	55.6
Job title	Administrative employee	38	17.8
	Teacher	176	82.2

Research Instrument:

After surveying the previous studies, that examined the excellence standards according to Malcolm Baldrige's Model, a questionnaire was designed to know the extent to which institutional excellence standards are applied in Bethlehem's private schools based on Malcolm Baldrige's model. The questionnaire included two sections. The first section represents the demographic variables of the participants (gender, qualification, experience, job title), while the second section includes Baldrige's excellence standards. This section includes 41 statements. Moreover, the Likart Five-Point Scale is used for determining the degree of agreement of the study sample on the questionnaire statements for each part (5 = always, 4 = usually, 3 = sometimes, 2 = rarely, 1 = never).

The study tool validity:

After designing the study tool, the researchers tested its validity in two ways:

1. The arbitrators' comments: It was presented to a group of 15 arbitrators specialized in educational sciences, administrators in the Directorate of Bethlehem Governorate, and administrators specialized in private schools, in order to know their opinions about the statements and their clarity and potential to measure the phenomenon. The researchers followed the observations and modifications

that were agreed upon by more than (80%) of the arbitrators. After making the suggested modifications, the questionnaire included 42 statements in its final form.

2. Internal consistency validity:

To check the validity of the study tool's wording, the Pearson correlation coefficient was calculated for the questionnaire statements with the total score of the tool, as it is shown in Table (2), according to what was stated in (Asuero et al, 2006). The correlation value is weak if it is less than (0.30), medium if it ranges between (0.30 and 0.70), and strong if it is more than (0.70).

Table (2): Results of the Pearson Correlation Coefficient for the study tool

No.	R Value	Statistical significance	No.	R Value	Statistical significance	No.	R Value	Statistical significance
1	0.536**	0.000	15	0.690**	0.000	29	0.740**	0.000
2	0.583**	0.000	16	0.784**	0.000	30	0.555**	0.000
3	0.706**	0.000	17	0.735**	0.000	31	0.684**	0.000
4	0.713**	0.000	18	0.821**	0.000	32	0.755**	0.000
5	0.780**	0.000	19	0.758**	0.000	33	0.421**	0.000
6	0.754**	0.000	20	0.735**	0.000	34	0.779**	0.000
7	0.678**	0.000	21	0.759**	0.000	35	0.781**	0.000
8	0.631**	0.000	22	0.730**	0.000	36	0.773**	0.000
9	0.622**	0.000	23	0.755**	0.000	37	0.720**	0.000
10	0.744**	0.000	24	0.710**	0.000	38	0.749**	0.000
11	0.757**	0.000	25	0.709**	0.000	39	0.646**	0.000
12	0.742**	0.000	26	0.739**	0.000	40	0.652**	0.000
13	0.735**	0.000	27	0.747**	0.000	41	0.799**	0.000
14	0.750**	0.000	28	0.687**	0.000	42	0.759**	0.000

** Significant at $\alpha \leq 0.001$ * Significant at $\alpha \leq 0.050$

The study tool reliability:

The reliability of the tool was checked by calculating the reliability coefficient for all the study aspects, using the Cronbach alpha reliability equation. The tool is higher than (0.820), and these values indicate that the tool has high reliability and it is consistent with the purposes of the study. The following table embodies data of the reliability coefficient related to aspects and the total score.

Table (3): The reliability coefficient values for the aspects of the study tool

Aspects	Number of items	Reliability coefficient
Leadership	7	0.883
Strategic planning	7	0.900
Human resource management	6	0.908
Measurement, analysis and knowledge management	5	0.868
Operations Management	5	0.823
Focus on students	6	0.866
School performance results	6	0.881
Total	42	0.976

4-Results.

Results of the first question:

What is the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model?

For answering this question, the arithmetic means and standard deviations were calculated, the total score for these aspects is shown in Table (4).

Table (4): The arithmetic means and standard deviations related to the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model

No.	Aspects (standard)	means	Standard deviations	Degree	Percentage
1	School performance results	4.00	0.75	High	80.0
2	Leadership	3.99	0.69	High	79.8
3	Operations Management	3.95	0.70	High	79.0
4	Strategic planning	3.95	0.72	High	79.0
5	Focus on students	3.85	0.75	High	77.0
6	Measurement, analysis and knowledge management	3.82	0.79	High	76.4
7	Human Resource Management	3.74	0.91	High	74.8
Total		3.90	0.68	High	78.0

It is obviously shown in Table (4) that the arithmetic mean of the total score is (3.90), standard deviation is (0.68), and with a high score, with a percentage of (78.0%). The standard of "School Performance Results" scored the highest arithmetic mean (4.00), followed by the "Leadership" standard with an arithmetic mean (3.99), then the standards of "Operations Management" and "Strategic Planning" with an arithmetic mean (3.95), the standard of "Focus on students" with an arithmetic mean (3.85), followed by the standard of "measurement, analysis and knowledge management" with an arithmetic mean (3.82), and finally the standard of "human resources management" with an arithmetic mean (3.74).

Results of the second question:

Do the respondents' estimates of the extent to which institutional excellence standards are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model differ according to gender, qualification, experience, and job title?

The following null hypotheses were tested:

Ho1. There are no differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to gender.

The first hypothesis was tested using the t-test for independent samples according to the gender variable, as shown in Table (5).

Table (5): The results of the t-test for the independent samples of the respondents' response according to the gender variable

Aspect	Gender	No.	means	Standard deviations	t-value	Significance level
Leadership	Male	34	3.86	0.80	1.266	0.207
	Female	180	4.02	0.66		
Strategic planning	Male	34	3.79	0.70	1.423	0.156
	Female	180	3.98	0.72		
Human resource management	Male	34	3.56	0.97	1.234	0.218
	Female	180	3.77	0.90		
Measurement, analysis and knowledge management	Male	34	3.69	0.74	1.022	0.308
	Female	180	3.84	0.80		
Operations Management	Male	34	3.85	0.71	0.917	0.360
	Female	180	3.97	0.69		
Focus on students	Male	34	3.85	0.74	0.034	0.973
	Female	180	3.85	0.75		
School performance results	Male	34	3.92	0.75	0.650	0.516
	Female	180	4.01	0.75		
Total	Male	34	3.79	0.69	1.062	0.289
	Female	180	3.93	0.68		

The source: Prepared by researchers based on SPSS.V21

Table No. (5) reveals that the "t" value for the total score is (1.062), and the level of significance is (0.289), meaning that there are no statistically significant differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the arithmetic means of the respondents' estimates of the extent to which institutional excellence standards are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate, according to Malcolm Baldrige's model, due to the gender variable, and thus the first null hypothesis is accepted.

Ho2. There are no differences at the level of significance ($\alpha \geq 0.05$) between the

averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the educational qualification.

The second null hypothesis was examined using one-way analysis of variance, as shown in Table No. (6).

Table (6): Results of one-way analysis of variance of the respondents' responses related to the educational qualification variable

Field	Source of variance	Sum of squares	Degrees of freedom	Mean square	F value	Level of significance
Leadership	Between groups	1.063	2	0.531	1.123	0.327
	Within groups	99.807	211	0.473		
	Total	100.870	213			
Strategic planning	Between groups	1.148	2	0.574	1.109	0.332
	Within groups	109.228	211	0.518		
	Total	110.376	213			
Human resource management	Between groups	2.790	2	1.395	1.682	0.189
	Within groups	174.988	211	0.829		
	Total	177.777	213			
Measurement, analysis and knowledge management	Between groups	0.885	2	0.443	0.701	0.497
	Within groups	133.340	211	0.632		
	Total	134.226	213			
Operations Management	Between groups	2.236	2	1.118	2.344	0.098
	Within groups	100.656	211	0.477		
	Total	102.893	213			
Focus on students	Between groups	2.281	2	1.140	2.059	0.130
	Within groups	116.867	211	0.554		
	Total	119.147	213			
School performance results	Between groups	2.175	2	1.087	1.945	0.145
	Within groups	117.936	211	0.559		
	Total	120.111	213			
Total	Between groups	1.588	2	0.794	1.728	0.180
	Within groups	96.935	211	0.459		
	Total	98.522	213			

The source: Prepared by researchers based on SPSS.V21

Table No. (6) shows that the F-value for the total score is (1.728) and the level of significance is (0.180), which is greater than the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$). This indicates that there are no statistically significant differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the arithmetic means of the participants' estimates regarding the extent to which the standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate, on the basis of the Malcolm Baldrige model, which can be attributed to the educational qualification variable. Thus, the second null hypothesis was accepted.

Ho3. There are no differences at the level of significance ($\alpha \geq 0.05$) between the averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to years of experience.

The third null hypothesis was examined using one-way analysis of variance, as shown in Table No. (7).

Table (7): Results of one-way analysis of variance for the respondents' response related to the variable of years of experience

Aspect	Source of variance	Sum of squares	Degrees of freedom	Mean square	F value	Level of significance
Leadership	Between groups	1.628	2	0.814	1.731	0.180
	Within groups	99.242	211	0.470		
	Total	100.870	213			
Strategic planning	Between groups	2.232	2	1.116	2.177	0.116
	Within groups	108.144	211	0.513		
	Total	110.376	213			

Aspect	Source of variance	Sum of squares	Degrees of freedom	Mean square	F value	Level of significance
Human resource management	Between groups	6.312	2	3.156	3.884	0.022
	Within groups	171.465	211	0.813		
	Total	177.777	213			
Measurement, analysis and knowledge management	Between groups	1.354	2	0.677	1.075	0.343
	Within groups	132.872	211	0.630		
	Total	134.226	213			
Operations Management	Between groups	0.838	2	0.419	0.866	0.422
	Within groups	102.055	211	0.484		
	Total	102.893	213			
Focus on students	Between groups	1.449	2	0.725	1.299	0.275
	Within groups	117.698	211	0.558		
	Total	119.147	213			
School performance results	Between groups	0.541	2	0.271	0.477	0.621
	Within groups	119.570	211	0.567		
	Total	120.111	213			
Total	Between groups	1.636	2	0.818	1.781	0.171
	Within groups	96.886	211	0.459		
	Total	98.522	213			

The source: Prepared by researchers based on SPSS.V21

Table No. (7) reveals that the F-value for the total score is (1.781) and the level of significance is (0.171), which is greater than the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$). This result reflects that there are no statistically significant differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the average estimates of the respondents regarding the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate in the light of Malcolm Baldrige's model according to the variable of years of experience. Therefore, the third null hypothesis was accepted.

Ho4. There are no differences at the level of significance ($\alpha \geq 0.05$) between the averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the job title.

The fourth hypothesis was examined using the t-test for independent samples, related to the job title variable, as shown in Table (8).

Table (8): t-test results for independent samples of the respondents' response according to the job title variable.

Aspect	Job title	No.	mean	Standard deviations	t-value	sig
Leadership	Administrative employee	38	4.27	0.59	3.069	0.003
	Teacher	176	3.93	0.69		
Strategic planning	Administrative employee	38	4.15	0.64	2.015	0.048
	Teacher	176	3.91	0.73		
Human resource management	Administrative employee	38	3.95	0.95	1.578	0.116
	Teacher	176	3.69	0.90		
Measurement, analysis and knowledge management	Administrative employee	38	3.94	0.82	1.036	0.301
	Teacher	176	3.79	0.79		
Operations Management	Administrative employee	38	4.15	0.63	2.041	0.046
	Teacher	176	3.91	0.70		
Focus on students	Administrative employee	38	4.06	0.61	2.225	0.030
	Teacher	176	3.81	0.77		
school performance results	Administrative employee	38	4.30	0.64	3.070	0.003
	Teacher	176	3.93	0.76		
Total	Administrative employee	38	4.12	0.59	2.456	0.017
	Teacher	176	3.86	0.69		

The source: Prepared by researchers based on SPSS.V21

Table No. (8) shows that the "t" value for the total score is (2.456), and the level of significance is (0.017). This result indicates a presence of statistically significant differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the averages of the respondents' estimates of the extent to which institutional excellence standards are applied in the private schools in Bethlehem governorate in the light of Malcolm Baldrige's model, which are attributed to the variable of job title, and the differences were in favor of the administrative staff. Thus, the fourth null hypothesis is rejected.

Discussions.

The results showed that the first question got a high degree estimation, with arithmetic mean (3.90). The arithmetic means of the fields of the study tool ranged between 3.74 and 4.00, and this result means that they were all highly rated. The researchers link this result to the strong competition between private schools on the one hand, and between them and government schools on the other hand. The arithmetic means of the study tool aspects ranged between (3.74) and (4.00), meaning that all of them recorded high scores. This result agreed with Hassan (2021), Baraka (2020), Zorob (2020). However, this result differed from the result of Ammar (2020), Al-Anzi (2018), and Al-Dahdar (2017), as the degree of application of institutional excellence standards in their study community according to Malcolm Baldrige's model recorded a medium degree, and to a small degree in Al-Farra and Shoumed (2015), and Sanjak (2012).

The results of the first hypothesis also showed that there were no differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the averages of the study sample's estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence were applied in private schools in Bethlehem on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the respondents' gender. This result reflects that private schools are concerned with applying the standards of institutional excellence to raise the performance of their schools to the maximum extent possible in all aspects of the educational process. This interest is shown by the administrative and academic staff that includes administrative staff and teachers of both genders. Furthermore, this result agreed with the results of some previous studies, such as Zorob (2020), Al-Anzi (2018), and AbuSaadi (2022). However, it differed from the result of Abdullatif (2018), which showed that there were differences due to the gender variable in favor of females. It also differed with the result of Hassan (2021), which showed that there were no differences due to the gender variable in all fields except for the quality of outputs, and in favor of males.

The results of the second hypothesis showed that there were no differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the averages of the study sample's estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence were applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the educational qualification. The researchers attributed this result to the fact that the school staff, administrators and teachers have a unitary view of the importance of the availability of standards of excellence in their schools, regardless of their academic qualification. The results demonstrated that all criteria of excellence were important in their view. This result agreed with the results of some previous studies such as Hajj and Nuri (2019), Abdullatif (2018), Shawa (2016), and Abu Saadi (2022).

The results of the third hypothesis showed that there were no differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the averages of the study sample's estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence were applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model due to the variable of years of experience. The researchers attributed this result to the reality that all teachers work under one umbrella of the standards of excellence set by the school, which is that they are subject to the same policies, strategic plans, objectives, procedures, educational processes, administrative decisions and work conditions that apply to all of them regardless of their years of experience. This result agreed with Abu Saadi (2022), Hassan (2021), Hajj and Nuri (2019), as they all showed that there were no differences due to the years of experience in the fields. But it differed with the result of Abdullatif (2018), which revealed that there were differences between the averages of the respondents' estimates due to the variable of years of experience and in favor of experience of more than 5 years and in the field of leadership and management only.

The results of the fourth hypothesis showed that there are differences at the level of significance ($0.05 \geq \alpha$) between the averages of the study sample's estimates of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied in private schools in Bethlehem governorate on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige's model, due to the job title variable, in favor of the administrative employee.

This result can be linked to the fact that the administrative staff members are the main ones responsible for the progress of the educational process within the school in all its aspects. It is consistent with Crum-Allen & Palmer (2016). However, it differed with the result of Hajj and Nuri (2019), and Palisoc (2012), which reflected no differences between the responses of the study sample members due to the job title variable.

Recommendations.

1. Training decision-makers and administrators on human resources management.
2. Creating effective channels of communication between universities and schools.
3. Establishing a system of incentives and grades in private schools, and encouraging and supporting the efforts of distinguished employees with all available capabilities.
4. Taking into consideration the standards of institutional excellence in drawing up the organizational structure of schools.

5. Participating in setting plans, policies and general goals of the school.
6. Training the administrative staff and teachers in private schools on the skills of scientific research and how to apply it.
7. Including international models of excellence, such as the Malcolm Baldrige model.
8. Setting an award for excellence for private and public schools according to the Malcolm Baldrige model.
9. Conducting a comparative study of the extent to which standards of institutional excellence are applied on the basis of Malcolm Baldrige standards in schools of various levels.

References.

- Abdullatif A (2018) The degree of achieving institutional excellence standards in UNRWA schools in Palestine and its relationship to the degree of strategic planning practice. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Al-Azhar University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Abu Raya M F (2014) The role of strategic planning in achieving institutional excellence: an applied study on the ministries of labor and social affairs. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Al-Aqsa University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Abu Saadi I (2022) The reality of managing excellence according to the EFQM model in schools in Bethlehem governorate from the point of view of teachers and principals. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Deanship of Graduate Studies, Al-Quds University, Palestine.
- Addallal M (2005) *Performance Evaluation Using Self-Assessment Approach and EFQM Excellence Model: the case of Abu Bhabi Police Collage*. Master's Thesis. University of Bradford, United Kingdom.
- Ajaif M (2008) Culture of Excellence in Some Semi Government Organizations in Dubai. In *Quality Congress Middle East /creating Architecture of Quality and Excellence in the Middle East*.
- Akbarnezhad R and Dayyani MH (2018) Evaluation of the Performance Excellence of Iran Public Libraries Based on the Malcolm Baldrige Model. *Research on Information Science & Public Libraries* 24 (3): 363-386.
- Alam QN, Aziz S A, Siddiqua N, Anis HA and Qazi R (2019) The leadership role of a principal in the performance of institution in comparison with leadership qualities of Malcolm Baldrige quality model. *Journal of Leadership* 6 (2): 143-150.
- Al-Anzi W (2018) The reality of the effectiveness of the Department of Development and Development in developing the technical and administrative skills of physics teachers in the State of Kuwait, based on the Malcolm Baldrige model. *Journal of the Islamic University for Educational and Psychological Studies* 26 (6): 740-757.
- Al-Dahdar M (2017) Evaluating the reality of the performance of universities in the Gaza Strip according to the Baldrige model: An exploratory study. *Journal of the Islamic University for Economic and Administrative Studies* 25 (2): 67-95.
- Al-Dajani IA. (2011) The role of strategic planning in the quality of institutional performance. Unpublished PhD Thesis. Faculty of Education, Damascus University, Syria.
- Al-Farra M and Sahmoud I (2015) The reality of excellence management at Al-Aqsa University according to the European Excellence Model EFQM. *Journal of the Islamic University for Economic and Administrative Studies*, 23 (2): 1-29.
- Al-Jubouri M (2009) The expected roles of international quality awards in perpetuating excellence and competitiveness, with reference to the King Abdullah Award for Excellence. *The third scientific conference of the Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences at the University of Applied Sciences, entitled Management of Business Organizations Contemporary Global Challenges, 27-29/4/2009, Amman, Jordan*.
- Al-Masry I O (2015) Management by roaming and its role in achieving institutional excellence: an applied study on the Ministry of Interior and National Security. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Al-Muzayen, I., and Al-Ghamdi, R. (2010). The European model of excellence benefits and criteria. In *the fifteenth annual meeting of the Saudi Society for Educational and Psychological Sciences*, King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia.
- Al-Najjar Z (2019) The degree of practice of principals of government basic schools in the governorates of Gaza to manage excellence and its relationship to the performance of their teachers. Unpublished Master's Thesis. College of Education, Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Al-Nuaimi M and Al-Sweis R (2008) *Achieving Accuracy in Quality Management: Concepts and Practices*. Dar Al-Yazuri for Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan.
- Al-Salami A (2002) *Excellence Management Models and Techniques of Management in the Age of Knowledge*. Dar Gharib for Printing, Publishing and Distribution, Cairo, Egypt.
- Al-Shamayleh N A (2004) The effect of additional role behaviors on organizational excellence in the Greater Amman Municipality. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Mutah University, Jordan.
- Al-Sousi YR (2015) The degree of practice of technical colleges in Gaza governorates to manage excellence and its relationship to competitive advantage. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine.

- Ammar A, Younis M and El-Sayed S (2020) Malcolm Baldrige Quality Model as an introduction to evaluating the performance of heads of academic departments at Menoufia University. *Journal of the College of Education* 35 (3): 236-259.
- Anastasiadou S and Taraza E (2019) The Structure and Paths of Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award (Mbnqa) Dimensions Applied in Greek Tertiary Education System. In the *EDULEARN19 Conference*, 1st-3rd July 2019, Palma, Mallorca, Spain.
- Asuero A, Sayago A and Gonzalez A (2006) The correlation coefficient: An overview. *Critical Reviews in Analytical Chemistry* 36 (1): 41–59.
- Aydin S and Kahraman C (2019) Evaluation of firms applying to Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award: a modified fuzzy AHP method. *Complex & Intelligent Systems*, 5 (1): 53–63. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40747-018-0069-9>
- Baraka A (2020) Standards of institutional excellence for public administrations in the Ministry of Education and Higher Education in the southern governorates of Palestine and their relationship to job performance from the point of view of their employees. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Barkman C (2015) The Characteristics of An Effective School Leader. *BU Journal of Graduate Studies in Education* 7 (1): 14-18.
- Battah A (2006) *Contemporary issues in educational administration*. Dar Al-Shorouq for Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan.
- Beer M (2003) Why total quality management programs do not persist: the role of management quality and implications for leading a TQM transformation. *Decision Science*, 34: 623-642. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5414.2003.02640.x>
- Bennett C J and Kinney S K (2018) Modifying the Strategic Planning Engine: A Case Study. *Planning for Higher Education* 46 (4): 18–26.
- Bolaji H S (2019) *Antecedent of human resource planning on skill inventory and audit: A study of KWARA state Ministry of finance ILORIN*. Faculty of Management Sciences, University of Ilorin, Nigeria.
- Chaudhry NI, Aftab I, Arif Z, Tariq, U and Roomi MA (2019) Impact of customer-oriented strategy on financial performance with mediating role of HRM and innovation capability. *Personnel Review* 48(3): 631-643. <https://doi.org/10.1108/PR-02-2018-0056>
- Cosby M (2018) Strategic Planning: Using SWOT or SOAR Analysis to Improve Your Organization: Why SOAR's Appreciative Inquiry theory may make it a better fit for law libraries. *AALL Spectrum* 23(1): 20–23.
- Crum-Allen P and Palmer L B (2016) Alignment of CTE Centers with the Baldrige Quality Award in Education Criteria: Perceptions of Leaders and Faculty. *Career and Technical Education Research* 41(1): 49-64.
- Diab S (2007) Developing a tool to measure the quality of schools, and using it to measure the quality and excellence of higher education schools in the Gaza Strip. In *the Quality Conference in Palestinian Public Education as an Introduction to Excellence*. Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Draft R (2009) *Management*. Fifth edition, The Dryden Press, New York.
- Flynn BB, Schroeder RG and Sakakibara S (1994) A Framework for Quality Management Research and an Associated Measurement Instrument. *Journal of Operations Management* 11(4): 339-366. [http://doi:10.1016/s0272-6963\(97\)90004-8](http://doi:10.1016/s0272-6963(97)90004-8)
- Ghorab H and Abu Sultan A (2007) The effectiveness of the Distinguished Schools Program in improving the quality of public education in UNRWA schools in Gaza. In *the Quality Conference in Palestinian Public Education as an Introduction to Excellence*. Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Grote D (2002) *The Performance Appraisal Question And Answer Book a Survival Guide for Managers*. American Management Association, New York, USA.
- Hajj N and Nuri M (2019) The degree of application of Malcolm Baldrige standards for total quality in Algeria Telecom Corporation from the point of view of its employees. *Journal of the Academy of Social and Human Studies* (21): 29-50.
- Haniyeh M A (2016) The extent of practicing strategic agility and its relationship to the excellence of institutional performance in the food industries sector in the Gaza Strip. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Hassan B (2021) The Degree of Application of Malcolm Baldrige Standard for Total Quality: A Field Study on the Baniyas Oil Refining Company in Syria. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Syrian Virtual University, Syria.
- Hertz H S (1999) *Criteria for Performance Excellence: Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award*. DIANE Publishing.
- Heryenzus and Suali (2018) Analysis of the Malcolm Baldrige Approach to the Performance of the Batam City Regional General Hospital. *Proceedings of the National Seminar on Social Sciences and Technology (SNISTEK)* 1: 79–84.
- Jaber A (2015) The reality of human resource management according to the European model of excellence in the Palestinian government sector and ways to develop it. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Al-Aqsa University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Jadurra (2013) *Management of Creativity and Competitive Excellence*. Al-Dar Al-Handasia Press, Cairo, Egypt.
- Kahil A (2009) The role of the school administration in developing the quality of effective teacher performance to achieve excellence. In *the second scientific conference, "The Role of the Arab Teacher in the Era of Knowledge Flow"*, Jerash University, Jordan.
- Khoqir, M B (2017) The level of excellence among faculty members at the College of Education for Girls at King Abdulaziz University. *Journal of Arab Studies in Education and Psychology* 84: 331-367.

- Khudair K B (2001) Quality Indicators of higher Education Output in the GCC Countries: Analytical Study. *Journal of Cooperation, Gulf Cooperation Council*53:13–34.
- Kiranmayi C, Sreenivas T and Suresh B N (2014) Towards Excellence in School Education TQM as a Strategy. *TIJ Journal of Social Sciences and Management*3(10):151-159.
- Klar H W and Brewer C A (2013) Successful leadership in high-needs schools: An examination of core leadership practices enacted in challenging contexts. *Educational Administration Quarterly*49(5): 768-808.
- Lin M (2012) Cultivating an environment that contributes to teaching and learning in schools: High school principals' actions. *Peabody Journal of Education*87 (2): 200-215. doi:10.1080/0161956X.2012.664467
- Mendels P and Mitgang L D (2013) Creating strong principals. *Educational Leadership*70 (7): 22-29.
- Menezes P, Martins H and Oliveira R (2018) The excellence Baldrige criteria in the effectiveness of higher education institutions management. *Brazilian Business Review*15 (1): 47-67.
- National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) (2021) *Malcolm Baldrige Biography*. <https://www.nist.gov/baldrige/how-baldrige-works/about-baldrige/history/malcolm-baldrige-biography>
- Palisoc A (2012) Academic Institutions Performance Based On Malcolm Baldrige Education Criteria for Performance Excellence: An Assessment. Unpublished Thesis. Cubao Quezon City.
- Rahayu N, Adawiyah W and Anggraeni A (2019) Malcolm Baldrige Education Criteria For Performance Excellent of Vocational School In Rural Area. *International Conference on Rural Development and Entrepreneurship 2019: Enhancing Small Business and Rural Development Toward Industrial Revolution*4,0, 5 (1).
- Sanjak G and Khairuddin M (2012) The extent to which Malcolm Baldrige Award standards are applied in Jordanian private hospitals that have obtained the International Accreditation Certificate (JCI). *The Jordanian Journal of Business Administration* 8 (1): 42-60.
- Saqr M (2016) The reality of managing excellence in the Palestinian universities in the governorates of Gaza and ways to develop it. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine.
- Saygin C (2019) KPIs Drive Strategic Planning and Execution: And Feedback Steers the Institution in the Right Direction. *Planning for Higher Education* 47 (4): 10–19.
- Setiawan and Purba H (2021) A Systematic Literature Review of Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award (MBNQA). *Journal of Technology Management for Growing Economies* 12 (1): 1-12. doi:10.15415/jtmge.2021.121001.
- Shawa E (2016) The degree of practice of principals of government secondary schools in the governorates of Gaza to manage excellence in the light of the European Excellence Model (EFQM) and ways to develop it. Unpublished Master's Thesis, The Islamic University, Gaza, Palestine
- Standen J (2004) *The EFQM Excellence Model*. <http://www.jimstanden.co.uk/>
- US DoCNBS U.S Department of Commerce National Institute of Standards and Technology (2003) Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award criteria for performance excellence, Washington, DC.
- Whitaker T (2012) *What great principals do differently: 18 things that matter most* (2nd ed.) Larchmont, NY: Eye on Education.
- Zorob S M (2020) The degree of availability of the dimensions of excellence management in private schools in the governorates of Gaza and its relationship to the organizational commitment of teachers there. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Al-Azhar University, Gaza, Palestine.