Journal of Economic, Administrative and Legal Sciences Volume (4), Issue (4): 30 Apr 2020 P: 166 - 181



مجلة العلوم الاقتصادية والإدارية والقانونية المجلد (4)، العدد (4): 30 إبريل 2020 م ص: 166 - 181

Philip Morris International's Ethical Dilemma of Child Labor

Azza Asaad Tonsi

Department of Management and Finance || Um Al-Qura University || KSA

Abstract: Tobacco production is a multi-billion-dollar global industry. Unfortunately, the cultivation of tobacco in some companies engages the labor of children throughout the world in extremely dangerous environments, which has both immediate and long-term consequences for children and society. This paper explores Philip Morris International company's ethical dilemma of child labor and the human rights concerns associated with child labor. The purpose of the following research is to analyze the history of Philip Morris International in regards to child labor in Kazakhstan ,and examining the company's responses and policy implementation. It is the ambition of this research to offer further recommendations to resolve the ethical dilemma. The aim of the research is to emphasize on the importance of health and education for children more than jobs. Also, to show how negative public image can influence the business in different ways, such as stock prices , political influence, sales, and the morale of employees might be affected as well. Although PMI is blamed for its child labor unethical practices, but its social responsibility duties are met. Phillip Morris practice its philanthropic, legal, ethical, and economic responsibilities through various activities. The research also discusses the arguments for and against child labor in Tobacco production. Poverty is the main cause of child labor in agriculture, together with limited access to quality education and access to adult labor, and traditional attitudes towards children's participation in agricultural activities. The primary research tool was surveys.

The survey had fixed sets of questions, which are used to collect quantifiable information. The questions in the survey were yes and no questions. A format of ethical decision making was implemented by answering six test options by a sample size of 30 students. The test options were harm test, publicity test, defensibility test, reversibility test, colleague test, and organization test.

Although there have been abounding claims as well as evidence of the abuse of child labor laws in the United States of America, and frequently other countries

throughout the world; the following research is focused on one country which is

Kazakhstan.

and risks, and traditional attitudes towards children's participation in agricultural activities.

Finally, the research proposes general actions and recommendations to solve this problem. Pillip Morris International had developed a new code of conduct wherever they source Tobacco to show more support against child labor.

Keywords: child labor, ethical dilemma, Philip Morris International, Tobacco suppliers, whistle blowing, code of conduct.

المعضلة الأخلاقية لشركة فيليب موريس انترناشيونال الدولية بما يخص عمالة الأطفال

عزة أسعد تونسي قسم العلوم الإدارية والمالية || جامعة ام القرى || المملكة العربية السعودية الملخص: إنتاج التبغ يعد من الصناعات العالمية وتقدر بمليارات الدولارات. لسوء الحظ فإن بعض شركات زراعة التبغ تقوم بتوظيف الأطفال من جميع أنحاء العالم في بيئات خطيرة للغاية والتي لها عواقب فورية وطويلة الأجل على الأطفال والمجتمع. يستكشف هذا البحث المعضلة الأخلاقية لشركة فيليب موريس الدولية المتعلقة بعمل الأطفال ومخاوف حقوق الإنسان المرتبطة بذلك. سيتناول البحث تحليل لتاريخ شركة فيليب موريس الدولية فيما يتعلق بتوظيف الأطفال في كازاخستان وإجراءاتهم الإصلاحية ومدى تطبيقم البحث المعضلة الأخلاقية لشركة فيليب موريس الدولية فيما يتعلق بتوظيف الأطفال في كازاخستان وإجراءاتهم الإصلاحية ومدى تطبيقهم البحث تحليل لتاريخ شركة فيليب موريس الدولية فيما يتعلق بتوظيف الأطفال في كازاخستان وإجراءاتهم الإصلاحية ومدى تطبيقهم للسياسات القانونية. يهدف البحث إلى تقديم المزيد من التوصيات لحل هذه المعضلة الأخلاقية. يوضح البحث أهمية التعليم للأطفال ومعاوف حقوق الإنسان المرتبطة بذلك. سيتناول السياسات القانونية. يهدف البحث إلى تقديم المزيد من التوصيات لحل هذه المعضلة الأخلاقية. يوضح البحث أهمية التعليم للأطفال والسياسات القانونية. يهدف البحث إلى تقديم المزيد من التوصيات لحل هذه المعضلة المخلاقية. يوضح البحث ألم من تقرير الصورة العامة السلبية على النشاط التجاري بطرق مختلفة مثل أسعار الأسهم والنفوذ السياسي والمبيعات ومعنوبات الموظفين. على الرغم من ممارسات شركة فيليب انترناشيونال الدولية الغير أخلاقية بالنسبة العامان الأطفال، إلا أن واجباتهم ومسؤولياتهم الاجتماعية يتم استيفاؤها على أكمل وجه. تطبق شركة فيليب موريس مسؤولياتها الغيرية والغاولي أبران والبياته ومسؤولياتهم الاجتماعية يتم استيفاؤها على أكمل وجه. تطبق شركة فيليب موريس مسؤولياتها الغيرية والغانونية والأخلاقية والأفلاقين حمان من ملاسات. قامت فيليب موريس الدولية المولي من المارسات. قامت فيليب موريس مادولية بوضع قوانين جديدة لمحري الغيرية والقانونية والأخلاقية والاقتصادية من خلال محتاعية يتم استيفاؤها على أكمل وجه. تطبق شركة فيليب موريس مسؤولياتها الغيرية والغولي ألغال ألغير مانسات. قامت فيليب موريس الدولية فيليب موريس مالولياتها الغيري فاليب موريس مالمال الخيري فالمول إلى أكمل وجه. مارمات مركم واليب ماليبيبية لمحاية الخيري فالفوال ألغير قانولي في ما أمسان الدويية والمولي في فالغول الغولي في

أداة البحث الأساسية المستخدمة هي الدراسة الاستقصائية. يحتوي الاستطلاع على مجموعات ثابتة من الأسئلة والتي تستخدم لجمع معلومات قابلة للقياس الكمي. إجابات الأسئلة الواردة في الاستبيان هي إما بنعم أو لا. تم استخدام ستة أنواع من الاختبارات لاتخاذ القرارات الأخلاقية على عينة مكونة من (30) طالباً. أنواع الاختبارات المستخدمة هي اختبار الضرر واختبار النشر واختبار القابلية للدفاع واختبار القابلية للانعكاس واختبار الزميل واختبار المؤسسة. وعلى الرغم من وجود ادعاءات كثيرة وكذلك أدلة على إساءة معاملة الطفل في الولايات المتحدة الأمريكية وفي كثير من البلدان الأخرى حول العالم، سيركز البحث التالي على دولة واحدة وهي كازاخستان. وأخيرا، ستسرد بعض المقترحات الاجرائية وتوصيات عامة لحل هذه المشكلة.

الكلمات المفتاحية: توظيف الأطفال، معضلة أخلاقية، فيليب موريس الدولية، موردين التبغ، كاشف الفساد، القواعد السلوكية.

Introduction

Philip Morris International Story:

Philip Morris is one of the world's leading tobacco companies with its different products sold in about 180 countries around the world. The first Philip Morris tobacco shop was opened in London in 1847, and later in 1902 a small tobacco company was incorporated in New York. In 1960, Philip Morris was the smallest tobacco company amongst the six major ones in the U. S; however, by 1983, it had grown to the largest tobacco company in the U. S (Katrin Brusvang, 2012).

Philip Morris USA Inc. describes itself as a responsible organization. Criticism is often leveled against larger businesses whose products are hazardous to the health of consumers as critics understand their engagement as a way to promote themselves. According to Philip Morris social responsibility is very important, and for that reason it supports different causes and initiatives in local communities where its employees live and work. Also Philip Morris believes that it is possible for a tobacco manufacturer to be responsible despite the fact that its products are hazardous and are causing addiction (Katrin Brusvang, 2012).

The Tobacco Industry is a very challenging one when it comes to communication. Tobacco companies are not allowed to advertise their products in Europe: all tobacco advertising and sponsorship

on television has been banned within the European Union since 1991 under the Television without Frontiers Directive, written in 1989 (Diana Trama, 2011).

Philip Morris Social Responsibility

Carroll's pyramid of CSR is a model which takes four dimensions (responsibilities) into account when looking at the CSR of a business. The four responsibilities as pictured below (figure 1) are split into four levels: economic-, legal-, ethical- and philanthropic responsibilities (Katrin Brusvang, 2012).



Figure (1)The pyramid of corporate social responsibility (CARROLL1999:42)

The Carroll Pyramid of CSR

The corporate social responsibility is included in the business strategy of Philip Morris which also includes focusing and trying to understand its stakeholders. As a business organization; Philip Morris should perform in a manner consistent with the interests of its stakeholders. By recognizing these stakeholder responsibilities, Philip Morris should operate in a responsible way by fulfilling its shareholders' expectations on performance levels, produce its tobacco products in a way which live up to the expectations that are accepted by the adult consumers, and also creating jobs with acceptable salaries and furthermore, to create a good working environment that will make the employees retain their jobs.

In the 2010 Corporate Responsibility Report it can be read that Philip Morris USA together with U. S. Smokeless Tobacco Company (another subsidiary of Altria Group Inc.) cooperated with the U. S. Food and Drug Administration on issues dealing with tobacco products. In 1998 Philip Morris developed a Youth Smoking Prevention department whose main purpose is to prevent young people from smoking in the U. S. (Philip Morris 2011d). In 2010 the tobacco companies of Altria Group Inc. provided grants that should make it possible for kids in the U. S. to keep away from underage tobacco use and other risky

behaviors. In the report it can be read that it is expected that these grants have had impact on around 1. 4 million kids and 829,000 adult influencers (Katrin Brusvang, 2012).

Economic responsibility

Naturally, Philip Morris has an economic responsibility to fulfill as there would not be a business if it did not generate any profit. Philip Morris is the leading tobacco company in the U. S. which can be seen by the fact that it has a market share of 53. 4 percent. Philip Morris, together with its parent company Altria Group Inc. and its other subsidiaries, from 2009 to 2010 had an increase in profit by 21. 8% and in the revenue by 3. 4% ending up with revenue of \$24. 4 billion in 2010. Also the cigarettes division experienced a revenue increase by 3. 4% resulting in revenue of 21. 6 billion (Katrin Brusvang, 2012).

Legal responsibilities

Philip Morris, being a tobacco company, takes several legal responsibilities into consideration when doing business. Tobacco companies such as Philip Morris is amongst others obliged to follow The Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act, referred to as Tobacco Control Act, which authorizes the U. S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) to "regulate the manufacture, distribution, and marketing of tobacco products to protect public health" (U. S. Food and Drug Administration 2012b).

Ethical responsibility

The ethical responsibility of Philip Morris deals with its obligation to run the business in a fair and good way. An example of how Philip Morris is fulfilling some ethical responsibilities is that it has a Code of Conduct with guidelines for all employees and other internal stakeholders of Philip Morris to follow.

Philanthropic responsibility

The philanthropic responsibility deals with a business' responsibility to give back to the communities in which it operates. Philip Morris is proud of its engagement in CSR and its possibility to give "back to the communities that we call home, including providing grants to community organizations" (Philip Morris USA 2011b). Philip Morris, together with its parent company, has decided to focus their donations on four key areas in the U. S.: arts and culture, education, environment and positive youth development. Altria Group Inc. and its subsidiary Philip Morris spend millions of dollars on charitable giving yearly and over the last ten years they have donated more than \$1. 3 billion to non-profit organizations.

Being a tobacco company requires dealing with several complex issues as the product and the way it is produced, which is harmful both to the consumers and to the surroundings. Therefore, a tobacco company such as Philip Morris needs to promote itself twice as hard as a 'regular' company to be seen as a social responsible company. The main ethical issue that PMI has is child labor content in the supply chain.

The main ethical dilemma (Problem Statement)

Child Labor

The employment of children under the law age "usually under 18 years old" is defined as child labor. Sixty percent of child laborers work in agriculture. The total amount of child laborers is estimated at over ninety eight million boys and girls. Being one of the most dangerous sectors in terms of labor, agriculture is one of the top three highest occupations for work-related fatalities, non-fatal accidents, and occupational diseases.

A vast majority of children who work in agriculture are unpaid family members. Poor societies in less developed countries tend to send their kids to work in order to guarantee an extra income for the family. Kids between 5 and 17 years old work in manufacturing and agriculture within conditions that is physically and socially dangerous. In 2017; statistics showed that 152 million kids are forced to work, half of them (73 million) works in risky jobs (Global Estimates of Child Labor); Children who work in tobacco farms are engaged in the worst forms of work; they work aside with their parents and perform difficult tasks that are not fit with their abilities for long hours. While poverty is the main reason that make children work, there are other factors such as; lack of good schools so children instead of attending schools they work for more than 12 hours a day, low wages, inflexible market, lack of manufacturing technology and unstable economy.

A number of outsourcing organizations in their supply chain depend on child labor due to the low wages of children. Employers prefer to employ kids because they are easier to control and can be treated as slave; they believe that kids are obedient more than adults.

Philip Morris International Manufacturer uses child labor and Human Trafficking in manufacturing its cigarettes in Kazakhstan:

Philips Morris produces different cigarette brands such as Davidoff and Marlboro for over 150 countries around the globe. In 2009, Tobacco giant Philip Morris purchased 1,500 tones of tobacco from Kazakh farms. Philip Morris has admitted to have contracted with farms in Central Asia state of Kazakhstan in which captive children as young as 10 years old has been forced to work in tobacco production. The company contracts with 300 farms in Kazakhstan, employing about 1,200 seasonal workers. These workers are typically accompanied by about 200 Children. All those factors can damage children's health and personal development due to long working hours and hazardous work conditions involved. Being one of the most dangerous sectors in terms of labor, agriculture is one of the top three highest occupations for work-related fatalities, non-fatal accidents, and occupational diseases.

The number of cases that Philips has confessed to regarding children labor amounted to 72 cases were children has been exposed to extended work hours in the tobacco farm which is a subsidiary branch of Philip Morris International; Philip Morris Kazakhstan.

It has been found by the International Labor organization that 59% of children used in child labor are found working in agriculture, and a large percentage perform hazardous type of work. In various cases, the complex challenges arising from socioeconomic realities and cultural practices result in Child labor. Agriculture is one of the top three highest occupations for work-related fatalities, non-fatal accidents, and occupational diseases. All those factors can damage children's health and personal development due to long working hours and hazardous work conditions involved being one of the most dangerous sectors in terms of labor.

Reports have found that these children were missing out on months of school and that were exposed to hazardous levels of nicotine as the harvesters of tobacco in a single day are exposed to amount to nicotine that would be found in 36 cigarettes of average strength. Children and Adults working at the farms are prone to Green Tobacco Sickness; in which nicotine gets absorbed through skin upon contact with the leaves of tobacco. This sickness results in vomiting, nausea, headache, dizziness, and muscle weakness. Due to their small bodies, children are more prone to this disease. Even more shockingly, reports have indicated that a laborer on a tobacco farm can absorb the equivalent amount of nicotine to that of a smoker inhaling thirty six cigarettes within twenty-four hours. Also, children had rashes on their necks and stomachs from handling the tobacco.

Children were reported to have been exposed to dangerous pesticides and extreme heat.

The cultivation of tobacco requires lots of hard work, and the Human Right Work discovered that children are exploited in every step in the cultivation process; from seeding process to pesticides application to the harvesting of the tobacco, this is done sometimes by hand and other times using machines. When done by hands it requires them to literally work on knees and hands to pick up the weeds. In case of tools or machines usage, there is an increase percentage of being exposed to grave injuries from sudden lacerations. Also, younger children have developed red rashes on their stomachs and necks as a result of their exposure to all of the above.

The Human Rights Watch reported that; most of the migrant workers who work at the tobacco farms came from the neighboring Kyrgyzstan. These workers faced conditions that were equivalent to forced labor; As the tobacco farms contractors that sold tobacco to Philips international had the workers' passports confiscated and forced migrants to work for long hours without earning any income or drinking clean water or other sanitary facilities.

People trafficking schemes were conducted as; intermediaries who arranged the migration journeys for the families coming from Kyrgyzstan expected them to pay back unrealistic debts for their journey. Thus, as a result of this arrangement, these workers ended up working illegally when their 90dayvisaperiods is over. This arrangement has placed them at their employer's mercy that would turn them over to the authorities if they don't abide by their pay.

Even though Philip Morris International makes billions of dollars, his farm isn't provided with safety rules; some workers wear open-toed shoes and some workers don't even have shoes even though they work with sharp hoes that are used to destroy weeds.

Research Questions

Is making child labor illegal is a smart move?

Is banning child labor could cause families being deprived of money that can be used for children's education, food and health insurance?

Do child labor may save poor children from working in illegal and worse working conditions?

Do child work enhances economy in developing countries and improves the standard of living of poor families?

What are Human Rights Institutes duties to monitor the industry of tobacco companies and ensure its implementation of employment rights policies and standards?

What are the tobacco companies role to minimize the child labor dilemma?

Research Hypothesis

Child labor is an immoral practice that need to be solved on urgent basis by the collaboration of companies, government ,and children's parents.

Research Objectives

To discuss Philip Morris International ethical dilemma of child labor, and its actions to solve it.

To state appropriate solutions to solve the child labor issue in tobacco companies .

To emphasize on the importance of health and education for children more than jobs.

To emphasize on engaging with Philip Morris International stakeholders to improve people's livelihood in the tobacco- growing communities and enhance labor practices in farms.

To show how negative public image can influence the business in different ways, such as stock prices , political influence, sales, and the morale of employees might be affected as well.

Research importance

Child labor is one of the main social problems that need to be solved on urgent basis by the collaboration of companies, government and people (especially parents and teachers). Children in developing countries carry a prosperous future if the adult citizens took the responsibility and not use them in negative ways. They should have the chance to develop and grow within the happy environment of family and school. They should not be used by the parents to maintain the family's economical balance,

or by businesses to get employees at low cost. PMI recently developed clear policies against child labor and communicated those policies with suppliers and employees through training, and had the ALP Program to make sure they are following them. Setting up a procedure for reporting unethical behaviors related to child exploitation internally and externally will accelerate resolving problems. In brief, concentrating on children education and enhancing Family's overall economical situation and standard of living will eliminate the child labor issue.

Primary Research Tool

The primary research tool was surveys.

The survey had fixed sets of questions, which are used to collect quantifiable information. The questions in the survey were yes and no questions. A format of ethical decision making was implemented by answering six test options by a sample size of 30 students. The test options were harm test, publicity test, defensibility test, reversibility test, colleague test, and organization test. The six steps stands for different meanings as follows:

Harm test-does this option do less harm than any alternative?

- Publicity test—would I want my choice of this option published in the newspaper?
- Defensibility test—could I defend my choice of this option before a Congressional committee, a committee of my peers, or my parents?
- Reversibility test—would I still think the choice of this option good if I were one of those adversely affected by it?
- Virtue test—what would I become if I choose this option often?
- Professional test—what might my profession's ethics committee say about this option?
- Colleague test—what do my colleagues say when I describe my problem and suggest this option as my solution?
- Organization test—what does the organization's ethics officer or legal counsel say about this?

Test option	Whistle blowing	Reduce poverty	Support education	Stop Kazakhstan's suppliers	Report unethical actions by outside people	Support child labor protection organizations
Harm test	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	No
Publicity test	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes
Defensibility test	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes
Reversibility test	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes

Results

Discussions

Argument for child labor:

According to a study by The Royal Economic Society; Research done by two economic professors states that making child labor illegal is not a smart move and will result in more harm than good as it can damage the living standard and the economy of families in developing nations. Banning child labor could result families being deprived of money that can be used for children's education, food and health insurance.

Children from poor families are required to work to support their families' income. Kids are better of working in agriculture rather than being exposed to join criminal activities, such as; drugs and sex trade, in order to get money. Therefore; child labor may save poor children from working in illegal and worse working conditions.

Families who consist of for example 6 members; where the only earn-able person is the father, this would be a very difficult situation for them, if the child was to work he would help his family out with few bucks and at the same time save huge amounts of production costs.

In some countries such as Afghanistan and Pakistan, women aren't allowed to work outside. Thus, labor shortage is a major problem in some developing countries and children labor can help reduce this shortage to help poor families.

Kids are more suitable for doing some types of work than adults due to their nimble and soft fingers. Also because of their small sizes; they are able to move faster in fields and between machines in factories.

In this situation; argument for child labor goes under Utilitarianism theory "the greatest happiness for the greatest number". The downside of child labor is less than the benefits of their economic outcomes. Child work enhances economy in developing countries and improves the standard living of poor families.

Arguments against child labor:

As children are made to work on daily basis, they are prone to missing on school and on having a proper education, which is required, if they were to ever find a decent job that pays a good salary in the future when they are older. Since businesses are not bound by regulations; children are abused and exploited because of their young age, children are cheaper to hire, less likely to protest on salaries and working conditions, thus easier to fire.

Child labor is extremely immoral; Children are exposed to extremely harsh working conditions such as very long working hours (from 12 to 16 hours daily), health issues from chemical poisoning, and injuries from machinery accidents due to lack of safety, and lack of access to clean drinking water as well as toilet blocks. Children exposed to these working conditions suffer from life-long disabilities and usually die young.

Children workers often have extremely difficult working conditions: very long work duration (from 12 to 16 hours a day), injuries from machinery, and health problems from chemical poisonings, and no access to drinking water or toilet blocks. Children who have worked in these conditions suffer from life-long disabilities and die at younger ages. This kind of child labor is of course absolutely immoral.

Working in fields, agriculture, manufacturing and other kinds of child labor prevent children from living their childhood and take away their freedom as kids. Instead of being normal children who play, learn and be guided; child labor spend their time in hard work conditions and are forbidden from experiences normal children live.

In this situation; argument against child labor goes under Deontology theory. Human Rights Watches has duty to monitor the industry of tobacco companies and ensure its implementation of employment rights policies and standards. Therefore, due to this child labor dilemma with these arguments, Philips Morris International Leaders took reaction to solve the Child Labor Issue to keep the company's good reputation.

Literature Review

Impact on Stakeholders

Philip Morris does represent several stakeholders to whom the business has obligations to fulfill responsibilities and to create value. Stakeholders are affected by child labor dilemma; these are suppliers, customers, employees, government, societies and Advertisement agents.

Suppliers of tobacco for the cigarette in this case are farmers from Kazakhstan; most of these farms relay on children as workers due to their low wages and their obedience due to their young age. If child labor would be eliminated; these farms would be required to switch children with adult labor who require higher wages thus will increase labor cost.

Employees are also stakeholders. Working for a business with a negative reputation can be de motivating for employees; working for a business with a reputation of using child labor will create a bad work atmosphere and thereby making employees feel shame of working there. The negative company image due to child labor using will lead its employees to leave the company which will result in spending money on induction training of new employees. Also who work in tobacco manufacturing are children and adults, work in very difficult conditions as well as hazardous environment where there are no safety and health rights. They are sometimes exposed to Green Tobacco sickness, which affects them physically and emotionally.

Customers, especially in well-developed countries, concern about the ethicality of products; they avoid buying products with child labor in the supply chain of a product. According to a study on consumer purchase decision making; although some consumers do not search for ethical information about a product; they are influenced by those who concern hence makes them feel as less ethical. (Ehrich, Kristine and Irwin, Julie R.)

Society is an important stakeholder of a business. The society of USA and other developed countries criticize the use of child labor in supply chain. Awareness Campaigns and unions are voluntarily formulated to restrict child labor content in PMI and other tobacco companies. These calls lead Human Rights Watches to take actions in order to eliminate child labor issue. The society objection of the ethical issue of having child labor supply chain results in increasing the awareness of this unethical behavior done by tobacco companies which in return decrease the demand on its products. Americans used to have a very negative image of Philip Morris as a company depend on child labor; having a negative public image can influence the business in different ways; the stock prices can be affected, political influence may change, sales may decrease, and the morale of employees might be affected as well.

Governments are considered as stakeholders of a business because they control the industry and implement regulations on business. In tobacco industry; governments implement regulations to eliminate child labor content in supply chain. International Labor Organization is a United Nations agency was developed to deal with labor problem such as child labor; governments, employers and workers set labor standers and policies to eliminate child labors. ILO standers result in an ALP Code, which define clear principles and standers for farmers supply for PMI. Philip Morris needs to prove for governments that it is managing this issue in a responsible way in order to get new licenses to operate for example in a new state or country.

Advertisement agents are important stakeholders in tobacco business because it encourages teenagers to smoke and increase cigarette sales. Advertising tobacco product is misleading because it does not explicitly identify the harm of tobacco and the unethical issues linked to it such as child labor. It is unethical for TV channels to advertise for PMI and other tobacco firms that have child labor content. This unethical advertising affects the transparency of channels, which decrease audience trust.

Philips Morris leader's role

Philips Morris International has replied to the Human Rights Watch that they are "Grateful" and "Firmly opposed to child labor and all other labor abuses". Philip Morris International announced on November 5, 2014 that it will start buying US-grown tobacco through third party leaf supply companies instead of buying it directly from tobacco farmers. In 2011, Philips Morris international have set up the Agricultural Labor Practices (ALP) program in order to progressively eliminate child labor and improve labor practices on all farms from which tobacco is purchased. Their standards and expectations have been

communicated to all farms; resources needed to monitor conditions have been mentioned in order to find rational solutions to problematic practices.

The company's ALP program consists of four key components:

- 1- ALP code; which is based on International Labor organization, Rights at work, Declaration on Fundamental Principles defines clear standards and principles that are expected to be met by farmers who have contractual agreements with Philip Morris International or with a third-party tobacco supplier.
- 2- Training programs is provided for Philip Morris International suppliers, teams, farmers, and workers on ALP's code's standards and Principles and related issues.
- 3- An internal Monitoring system has been developed to identify and tackles problems and countryspecific assessments in-order to evaluate the labor conditions of the farms and the ALP program implementation.
- 4- Engagement with stakeholders to improve people's livelihood in the tobacco- growing communities and enhance labor practices in farms.

Addressing child labor challenges can't be done overnight or by a single company. Therefore, Philips Morris International has developed an approach to child labor wherever they source tobacco.

- Child Labor Policy: PMI's ALP code clearly states there shall be no child labor and specified a minimum age. The ALP's code forbids children who are under the age of 18 years old from working in hazardous areas.
- Field Support: 3,500 trained Field technicians do regular visits and continuously monitor tens of thousands of farms, they help ensure policies and standards are met by every person. They also make PMI expectations clear, while approaching and resolving problems with the farms realistically.
- Community Investment: To eliminate child labor; economic opportunities should be created for families. PMI is doing operational efforts aimed to enhance farming practices with community initiatives such as; working with different non-profitable organizations around the globe to access education, entrepreneurship training for women and enhance quality.

Furthermore, there was a noticeable change in the previous and current code of conduct of PMI to show more support against child labor:

This significant change between code of conducts of 2008 and 2017 was due to the 72 cases that were charged towards them by Human Rights Watch. In addition of the Agricultural Labor Practices (ALP) program, PMI had to change their policies to consistent with their code of conduct, so they include child

المجلة العربية للعلوم ونشر الأبحاث ـ مجلة العلوم الاقتصادية والإدارية والقانونية ـ المجلد الرابع ـ العدد الرابع ـ إبريل 2020م

labor protection that preserve the children rights in agricultural industries. PMI previous code of conduct in 2008 was mentioning the overall safety policies without specifying child labor policies. It emphasizes on providing employees with a safe and secure work environment in manufacturing locations, which are under significant workplace safety regulations. Also, it emphasizes on safety regulations for workers who spend significant portions of their workday driving vehicles on company related business. Each work location has safety rules that must be followed. The company does not only comply with government health and safety laws, it has its own health and safety policies, which often go beyond what the law requires. PMI current code of conduct 2017 is working to eliminate child, forced and other labor abuses in their supply chain. It is expected from the suppliers (farmers) to implement the requirements of the company's Agricultural Labor Practices Code. The company's charity giving programs facilitate creating jobs for rural communities.

Moreover, as an additional reaction, PMI had to add more policies and procedure to eliminate child labor to be able to defend them from Human Rights Watch and stand against child labor and all other labor abuses.

Some of PMI polices to eliminate child labor and human trafficking:

- Income and work hours: Workers shall not work excessive or illegal work hours.
- Fair treatment: this prevents the acts of harassment, discrimination, physical or mental punishment, or any other forms of abuse.
- Forced labor: all farm labor should be voluntary and not forced.
- Save work environment: provide a safe work environment that will prevent accidents and injuries.
- Freedom of Association: recognize and respect workers' rights.
- Compliance With the law: all workers should know their own rights before start working and sign the contract.

All of these new policies were added after many cases that were against them from Human Rights Watch. PMI needed to add them to protect their reputation from being unethical company, so they made it a mandatory rule to save employments right, gain more loyal customers, improve the company's practice and reserves their right.

Conclusion

Child labor is one of the main social problems that need to be solved on urgent basis by the collaboration of companies, government and people (especially parents and teachers). Children in developing countries carry a prosperous future if the adult citizens took the responsibility and not use them in negative ways. They should have the chance to develop and grow within the happy environment of family and school. They should not be used by the parents to maintain the family's economical balance,

or by businesses to get employees at low cost. PMI recently developed clear policies against child labor and communicated those policies with suppliers and employees through training, and had the ALP Program to make sure they are following them. Setting up a procedure for reporting unethical behaviors related to child exploitation internally and externally will accelerate resolving problems. In brief, concentrating on children education and enhancing Family's overall economical situation and standard of living will eliminate the child labor issue. Strategies should be adopted to ensure people have access to adequate training and technology, land and water for food production, according to their individual national circumstances. Global awareness of the matter examined with this paper, and health issues of smoking in general can also help improve the situations in the above mentioned developing countries; as well as other countries that have fallen victim to child labor abuse. Intervention is necessary, but rather problematic without a well-structured, highly developed, and enforceable international power.

Recommendations

- 1- Implement whistle-blowing policy to encourage employees to report unethical activity and misconducts to improve the company's performance.
- 2- Engage in charities to reduce poverty because it is the main reason for child labor. Most of families who face poverty send their children in young age to work and generate money.
- 3- Support education systems in developing countries in order to make education mandatory for all children.
- 4- Stop contracts with suppliers and farms of Kazakhstan and relay only on suppliers and farms from USA because they have restricted policies toward child labor and employment rights.
- 5- Setting up a procedure for reporting unethical behaviors by outside people and expose cases related to child exploitation to investigate all of them thoroughly and fairly then taking appropriate actions. There must be direct and responsive channels for any inquiries of the company's policies.
- 6- Specifying a portion of the company's budget for child labor protection organizations as a social responsibility act.
- 7- Expanding the development of the country's vast energy resources and exporting them to world markets; diversifying the economy outside the oil, gas, and mining sectors. Enhancing Kazakhstan's economic competitiveness.
- 8- Developing a multiparty parliament and advancing political and social reform; and strengthening relations with neighboring states and other foreign powers.

References

- Agriculture Al labor Pr Actives code. Philip Morris International. (2017). Philip Morris International Annual Report. Philip Morris International.

- Am J Public Health. 2012. "The Big WHY": Philip Morris's Failed Search for Corporate Social Value.
- Andre Calantzopoulos (2017,October). Guide Book for success The PMI Code of Conduct.
 Retrieved from https://www.pmi.com/resources/docs/default-source/our_company/code-of-conduct/english_code_of_conduct_external_online_180116. pdf?sfvrsn=f5c386b5_6
- Child Labour. (2012, Augest 9). Retrieved May 4, 2018, from pbengzon. blogspot: http://pbengzon. blogspot. com/2012/08/argumentative-essay-outline. html
- Diana Trama. 2011. "We are passionate about our social performance" Communicating CSR on the Corporate Website of a Tobacco Company.
- Dupont, M. (2010, August 9). Debating on Child Labor. Retrieved May 5, 2018, from wizness comunity: https://www.wizness.com/wizness/go.asp?u=/pub/NP&nId=200&lngWiz=EN
- Ehrich, Kristine and Irwin, Julie R., Willful Ignorance in the Request for Product Information
 (February 9, 2009). Journal of Marketing Research, Vol. 42, No. 3, pp. 266-277, 2005. Available at
 SSRN: https://ssrn.com/abstract=1340199
- Extremology. (2013, 3 3). http://www. extremology. com/2013/03/5-positive-sides-of-child-labor.
 html. Retrieved from Break the Barricade through blogging: http://www. extremology.
 com/2013/03/5- positive-sides-of-child-labor. html
- Forbes. (2017, 5 4). the world's most valuable brands. Retrieved from forbes: https://www. forbes. com/companies/marlboro/
- Fusion, R. R. (2014, 2 15). Makers of Marlboro ban children from working in tobacco fields. Retrieved from Project Earth: https://projectearth. us/makers-of-marlboro-ban-children-from-working-in-tobacco-1796423100
- Global Estimates of Child Labour: Results and trends, 2012-2016, Geneva, September 2017
- Goodwin, I. (2010, 7 15). Yahoo. Retrieved from Tobacco company sold cigarettes made from child labor: https://www. yahoo. com/news/blogs/upshot/tobacco-company-sold-cigarettes-made-childlabor-155528902. html
- Indian Journal of Gender Studies, Vol 21, Issue 1, pp. 135 144, First Published February 2, 2014
- Jacobs, R. T. (2015, July 15). Philip Morris International. Retrieved from https://www. researchgate. net/publication/280978266_Phillip_Morris_International_-_Child_Labor_in_Tobacco_Farms
- James, H. (2000). Children Labor. New York, NY: Scribner
- Katrin Brusvang. 2012. Philip Morris USA Inc. & Corporate Social Responsibility- going up into flames? CDC 24/7: saving lives, protecting people. (2017, 9 16). Smoking & Tobacco Use. Retrieved from Centers for disease control: https://www.cdc.

gov/tobacco/data_statistics/fact_sheets/tobacco_industry/brand_preferece/index. htm

Kenneth E. Warner, P. (2002, June). What's a Cigarette Company to Do? Retrieved May 4, 2018,
 from ncbi: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1447479/

- Louis C. Camilleri. (2008, March). The PMI Code of Conduct. Retrieved from http://phx.
 corporateir.net/External. File%3Fitem%3DUGFyZW50SUQ9MTAwMj R8Q2hpbGRJRD0tMXxUeX
 BIPTM%3D%26t%3D1.
- Nour Salahat, S. D. (2013, 10 6). Marlboro's Ethical Scandal. Retrieved from prezi: https://prezi. com/ awnicy1vauut/marlboros-ethical-scandal/
- Rosenberg, G. (1997, March 31). Philip Morris International Ethical Dilemma. The New York Times, p.
 D5
- Statista. (2016, 8 12). statista. Retrieved from the statistics portal: https://www.statista.com/ statistics/279873/global-cigarette-market-share-by-group/
- Upholding Labor Rights on Farms. (n. d.). Retrieved May 5, 2018, from pmi: https://www.pmi.com/sustainability/good-agricultural-practices/upholding-labor-rights-on-the-farms
- US: Tobacco Giant's Move Could Reduce Child Labor (2014,November5). Retrieved from https://www.hrw.org/news/2014/11/05/us-tobacco-giants-move-could-educe-child-labor
- Walker, S. (2010, 7 14). Tobacco giant Philip Morris sold cigarettes made using child labour. Retrieved from Independent: https://www. independent. co. uk/news/world/asia/tobacco-giant-philip-morris-sold-cigarettes-made-using-child-labour-2026759. html